

#2 Type: TR TF: TF4 Clause: 9.2.2 Page: 105 Line: 31 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

The current content of subclause 9.2 was lifted from 1904.1 package C and it is not clear why it would apply to 1904.4, which is supposed to be a derivation of Package A in 1904.1

Package A in 1904.1 supported only Events defined in IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 57 (IEEE Std 1904.1, subclause 9.2.6) - replace existing 9.2.2 with 9.2.6 from IEEE Std 1904.1 + update associated PICS If this not an accepted course of action, we need to build the whole OAM message set associated with event management from IEEE Std 1904.1 Package C, which is currently missing, as outlined in 9.2.2.1

Remove subclause 9.2.2 through 9.2.5, leave 9.2.6, and add editorial note to align with DPoE OAM spec, table 13. Update PICS as needed.

#3 Type: TR TF: TF4 Clause: 9.2.4 Page: 115 Line: 14 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

"BatteryVoltLow" is missing definition right now - there is no subclause

If the list is to be complete, move in IEEE Std 1904.1, subclause 9.2.4.5 into our draft and insert between existing 9.2.4.4 and 9.2.4.5. Update PICS accordingly.

See comment #2 for changes

#17 Type: T TF: TF4 Clause: 9.3.3.2.1 Page: 130 Line: 20 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

"This variable is expressed in units of milliseconds, and its value is provisioned using the management." "provisioned using the management" is too broad and not useful. We have a specific attribute for it.

Replace "provisioned using the management" with "provisioned using the *aOnuConfigHoldoverPeriod* attribute (see 14.4.9.4).

-

#4 Type: E TF: TF4 Clause: 9.3.4.3.1 Page: 137 Line: 6 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

missing reference to extended OAM discovery

Change the red "see TBD" to "see 13.3.2" and make the link live - the same change in 9.3.4.3.2, and in T-LPTE3, and U-LPTE3

-

#5 Type: E TF: TF4 Clause: 9.3.4.3.1 Page: 137 Line: 7 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

missing reference to ONU authentication

Change the red "see TBD" to "see 11.3" and make the link live - the same change in 9.3.4.3.2, and in T-LPTE3, and U-LPTE3

Changes per comment. Implement *before* comment #24.

#24 Type: TR TF: TF4 Clause: 11 Page: 153 Line: 1 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

Clause 11 has a number of issues: Sections 11.3.3.4 and 11.3.3.5 list multiple requirements attached to NAC certificate and intermediate certificates. All those certificates are created by operator and are installed in ONUs at run time. These requirements apply to neither OLT, not ONUs. Authentication and authorization procedures would benefit from showing state diagrams. The text describing the sequence of steps to establish secure ONU operation does not match the Figure 11-4. ONU onboarding section needs to describe different scenarios based on whether ONUs are pre-verified, user accounts are pre-verified, etc. Section 11.4 only describes how the initial key is derived, but also needs to explain how it is activated. A protocol for retrieving a passphrase from ONU needs to be specified. It is not a trivial eOAM Get_Request/Get_Response, because user input takes longer than the eOAM timeout. Figure 11-5 shows that under some conditions, ONU is suspended, but there is no explanation anywhere on what the suspension means or how it is started or stopped. Clause organization is confusing as it jumps from encryption to authentication and onboarding, then back to encryption. Key establishment clauses belong to encryption, not to authentication.

Clause 11 has been re-written to address all the listed issues. Use the new text as shown in tf4_2406_kramer_1f_clean.pdf. A diff version is provided for reference (tf4_2406_kramer_1f_diff.pdf)

Changes per tf4_2406_kramer_1f_clean.pdf with the following edits: + change 1491 to 1489 + in table 13-22, change < to <= for CertificateData and Pad fields Update PICS for Clause 11

#6 Type: E TF: TF4 Clause: 11.2.6 Page: 159 Line: 35 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

TBD in yellow

Change TBD to 11.3 and make the link live

Addressed in comment #24

#7 Type: ER TF: TF4 Clause: 11.3.3.3 Page: 161 Line: 37 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

Missing Annex 11A

Insert an editorial note indicating that the Annex 11A is missing

Addressed in comment #25

#8 Type: E TF: TF4 Clause: 11.3.3.4 Page: 162 Line: 11 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Unclear what the section 2.1.1.1 is referencing to

Change to "RFC-5480, section 2.1.1.1" - similar change in 11.3.3.5 in two places marked in green

Implement after comment #24

#9 Type: TR TF: TF4 Clause: 11.3.5 Page: 164 Line: 15 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

The "aOnuNakPublicKey attribute" does not exist in the draft right now and it is the only location where it is listed/

Insert an editorial note indicating that the aOnuNakPublicKey attribute is missing and needs to be added

Addressed in comment #24

#10 Type: TR TF: TF4 Clause: 11.3.5 Page: 164 Line: 20 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

The "aOnuActivationPassphrase attribute " does not exist in the draft right now and it is the only location whetre it is listed/

Insert an editorial note indicating that the aOnuActivationPassphrase attribute is missing and needs to be added

Addressed in comment #24

#22 Type: E TF: TF4 Clause: 11.6.2.1 Page: 172 Line: 23 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Typo

change "stat" to "state"

-

#23 Type: T TF: TF4 Clause: 13.4.6.7.2 Page: 220 Line: 12 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Incorrect eOAMPDU name in Table 13-23 caption

Rename to " Structure of the eOAM_Install_NAC_Response eOAMPDU"

-

#11 Type: E TF: TF4 Clause: 14.2.1.2.3 Page: 240 Line: 16 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

"assigned during ONU's registration (see TBD), " - link missing

Change TBD to 7.4.2.1 and make the link live

Change TBD to "IEEE Std 802.3, 144.3.7"

#12 Type: E TF: TF4 Clause: 14.2.1.2.4 Page: 240 Line: 26 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

"service ports available in the ONU may be non-consecutive (see 5.x)." - missing link

Change TBD to 4.8.3 and make the link live

Change TBD to "14.6.2.9" and make the link live

#21 Type: T TF: TF4 Clause: 1.4 Page: 26 Line: 18 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Description of Clause 6 describes that clause in 1904.1. But it has the text "This Clause builds on the Clause 5 model of the EPON system." In 1904.4, C5 does not describes the model of EPON system anymore. C4 does.

Replace the description of clause 6 with the following text: Clause 6 redirects to IEEE Std 1904.1, Clause 6, which defines the Media Access Control (MAC) Client reference model and its functional blocks, comprising the Client ONU/OLT devices.

-

#20 Type: TR TF: TF4 Clause: 14.4 Page: 266 Line: 23 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

The onboarding procedure defined in Clause 11 requires new attributes/actions to prompt user for a passphrase and to retrieve that passphrase from the ONU.

add an attribute aPassphrase and an action acPassphrasePrompt as shown in tf4_2406_kramer_passphrase_attributes_1_diff.pdf tf4_2406_kramer_passphrase_attributes_1_clean.pdf is also available.

-

#13 Type: E TF: TF4 Clause: 14.4.6.1.1 Page: 337 Line: 36 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

"IEEE Std 802.3, 76.2.6.1.3.2." is incorrect, since it is a 10G-EPON link

Change to "IEEE Std 802.3, 144.3.5."

-

#14 Type: E TF: TF4 Clause: 14.4.9.2 Page: 365 Line: 24 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Incorrect reference to 9.3.3.3

Change to 9.3.3.1.2 and make the link live

-

#15 Type: E TF: TF4 Clause: 14.4.9.2 Page: 366 Line: 4 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

"IEEE Std 802.3, 64.3.5.1 and 77.3.5.1" is 1G/10G-EPON reference

Change to "IEEE Std 802.3, 144.3.8.1", also change "gate_timeout" to "GATE_TIMEOUT", since that is how it is specified in 802.3ca

-

#19 Type: TR TF: TF4 Clause: 4A.2.15 Page: 432 Line: 10 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

U-MC2b is an ONU PICS, but the Value/Comment refers to OLT. Also, a reference is shown as TBD.

Replace "OLT forwards multicast traffic based on rules per TBD." with "ONU forwards multicast traffic based on rules per Table 7-2." Make link live.

-

#25 Type: T TF: TF4 Clause: - Page: 471 Line: - Commenter: Craig Pratt / CableLabs
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Clause 11 can benefit from informational examples, in the form of an appendix
 The addition of an appendix, which can be found in tf4_2406_pratt_onuauthexamples_1.pdf
 Use tf4_2406_pratt_onuauthexamples_1.pdf and incorporate into draft as Annex 11A.

#18 Type: TR TF: TF4 Clause: 7.4.4.4.1 Page: 75 Line: 35 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

T-MC5 PICS without a shall.
 Replace the text "... the OLT applies..." with "... the OLT shall apply..."
 -

#1 Type: E TF: TF4 Clause: 8.4.3.1 Page: 90 Line: 16 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Cross reference in red and incomplete
 Change to "see 8.5.1" and make the link live
 See comment #16 for the change.

#16 Type: T TF: TF4 Clause: 8.4.3 Page: 90 Line: 16 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Reference to an incomplete clause number
 Replace 8.5.x.x with 8.5.3.1
 -