#21	Type: T	TF: TF4	Clause: 1.4	Page: 26	Line: 18	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

Description of Clause 6 describes that clause in 1904.1. But it has the text "This Clause builds on the Clause 5 model of the EPON system." In 1904.4, C5 does not describes the model of EPON system anymore. C4 does.

Replace the description of clause 6 with the following text: Clause 6 redirects to IEEE Std 1904.1, Clause 6, which defines the Media Access Control (MAC) Client reference model and its functional blocks, comprising the Client ONU/OLT devices.

-

#18	Type: TR	TF: TF4	Clause: 7.4.4.4.1	Page: 75	Line: 35	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

T-MC5 PICS without a shall.

Replace the text "… the OLT applies..." with "… the OLT shall apply..."

-

#16	Type: T	TF: TF4	Clause: 8.4.3	Page: 90	Line: 16	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

Reference to an incomplete clause number

Replace 8.5.x.x with 8.5.3.1

-

#1	Type: E	TF: TF4	Clause: 8.4.3.1	Page: 90	Line: 16	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed	Response Status: AIP	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

Cross reference in red and incomplete

Change to "see 8.5.1" and make the link live

See comment #16 for the change.

#2	Type: TR	TF: TF4	Clause: 9.2.2	Page: 105	Line: 31	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed	Response Status: AIP	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

The current content of subclause 9.2 was lifted from 1904.1 package C and it is not cleat why it would apply to 1904.4, which is supposed to be a derivation of Package A in 1904.1

Package A in 1904.1 supported only Events defined in IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 57 (IEEE Std 1904.1, subclause 9.2.6) - replace existing 9.2.2 with 9.2.6 from IEEE Std 1904.1 + update associated PICS If this not an accepted course of action, we need to build the whole OAM message set associated with event management from IEEE Std 1904.1 Package C, which is currently missing, as outlined in 9.2.2.1

replace existing 9.2.2 with 9.2.6 from IEEE Std 1904.1 + update associated PICS

#3	Type: TR	TF: TF4	Clause: 9.2.4	Page: 115	Line: 14	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed	Response Status: AIP	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

"BatteryVoltLow" is missing definition right now - there is no subclause

If the list is to be complete, move in IEEE Std 1904.1, subclause 9.2.4.5 into our draft and insert between existing 9.2.4.4 and 9.2.4.5. Update PICS accordingly.

move in IEEE Std 1904.1, subclause 9.2.4.5 into our draft and insert between existing 9.2.4.4 and 9.2.4.5. Update PICS accordingly.

#17	Type: T	TF: TF4	Clause: 9.3.3.2.1	Page: 130	Line: 20	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

"This variable is expressed in units of milliseconds, and its value is provisioned using the management." "provisioned using the management" is too broad and not useful. We have a specific attribute for it.

Replace "provisioned using the management" with "provisioned using the *aOnuConfigHoldoverPeriod* attribute (see 14.4.9.4).

-

#4	Type: E	TF: TF4	Clause: 9.3.4.3.1	Page: 137	Line: 6	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

missing reference to extended OAM discovery

Change the red "see TBD" to "see 13.3.2" and make the link live - the same change in 9.3.4.3.2, and in T-LPTE3, and U-LPTE3

-

#5	Type: E	TF: TF4	Clause: 9.3.4.3.1	Page: 137	Line: 7	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

missing reference to ONU authentication

Change the red "see TBD" to "see 11.3" and make the link live - the same change in 9.3.4.3.2, and in T-LPTE3, and U-LPTE3

-

#24	Type: TR	TF: TF4	Clause: 11	Page: 153	Line: 1	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

Clause 11 has a number of issues: Sections 11.3.3.4 and 11.3.3.5 list multiple requirements attached to NAC certificate and intermediate certificates. All those certificates are created by operator and are installed in ONUs at run time. These requirements apply to neither OLT, not ONUs. Authentication and authorization procedures would benefit from showing state diagrams. The text describing the sequence of steps to establish secure ONU operation does not match the Figure 11-4. ONU onboarding section needs to describe different scenarios based on whether ONUs are pre-verified, user accounts are pre-verified, etc. Section 11.4 only describes how the initial key is derived, but also needs to explain how it is activated. A protocol for retrieving a passphrase form ONU needs to be specified. It is not a trivial eOAM Get_Request/Get_Response, because user input takes longer than the eOAM timeout. Figure 11-5 shows that under some conditions, ONU is suspended, but there is no explanation anywhere on what the suspension means or how it is started or stopped. Clause organization is confusing as it jumps from encryption to authentication and onboarding, then back to encryption. Key establishment clauses belong to encryption, not to authentication.

Clause 11 has been re-writted to address all the listed issues. Use the new text as shown in tf4_2406_kramer_1f_clean.pdf. A diff version is provided for reference (tf4_2406 _kramer_1f_diff.pdf)

-

#6	Type: E	TF: TF4	Clause: 11.2.6	Page: 159	Line: 35	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: AIP   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

TBD in yellow

Change TBD to 11.3 and make the link live

Addressed in comment #24

#7	Type: ER	TF: TF4	Clause: 11.3.3.3	Page: 161	Line: 37	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: AIP   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

Missing Annex 11A

Insert an editorial note indicating that the Annex 11A is missing

Addresses in comment #25

#8	Type: E	TF: TF4	Clause: 11.3.3.4	Page: 162	Line: 11	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

Unclear what the section 2.1.1.1 is referencing to

Change to "RFC-5480, section 2.1.1.1" - similar change in 11.3.3.5 in two places marked in green

Implement after comment #24

#9	Type: TR	TF: TF4	Clause: 11.3.5	Page: 164	Line: 15	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: AIP   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

The "aOnuNakPublicKey attribute " does not exist in the draft right now and it is the only location whetre it is listed/

Insert an editorial note indicating that the aOnuNakPublicKey attribute is missing and needs to be added

Addressed in comment #24

#10	Type: TR	TF: TF4	Clause: 11.3.5	Page: 164	Line: 20	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: AIP   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

The "aOnuActivationPassphrase attribute " does not exist in the draft right now and it is the only location whetre it is listed/

Insert an editorial note indicating that the aOnuActivationPassphrase attribute is missing and needs to be added

Addressed in comment #24

#22	Type: E	TF: TF4	Clause: 11.6.2.1	Page: 172	Line: 23	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

Typo

change "stat" to "state"

-

#23	Type: T	TF: TF4	Clause: 13.4.6.7.2	Page: 220	Line: 12	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

Incorrect eOAMPDU name in Table 13-23 caption

Rename to " Structure of the eOAM_Install_NAC_Response eOAMPDU"

-

#11	Type: E	TF: TF4	Clause: 14.2.1.2.3	Page: 240	Line: 16	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

"assigned during ONU's registration (see TBD), " - link missing

Change TBD to 7.4.2.1 and make the link live

-

#12	Type: E	TF: TF4	Clause: 14.2.1.2.4	Page: 240	Line: 26	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

"service ports available in the ONU may be non-consecutive (see 5.x)." - missing link

Change TBD to 4.8.3 and make the link live

-

#20	Type: TR	TF: TF4	Clause: 14.4	Page: 266	Line: 23	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

The onboarding procedure defined in Clause 11 requires new attributes/actions to prompt user for a passphrase and to retrieve that passphrase from the ONU.

add an attribute aPassphrase and an action acPassphrasePrompt as shown in tf4_2406_kramer_passphrase_attributes_1_diff.pdf tf4_2406_kramer_passphrase_attributes_1_clean.pdf is also available.

-

#13	Type: E	TF: TF4	Clause: 14.4.6.1.1	Page: 337	Line: 36	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

"IEEE Std 802.3, 76.2.6.1.3.2." is incorrect, since it is a 10G-EPON link

Change to "IEEE Std 802.3, 144.3.5."

-

#14   Type: E   TF: TF4   Clause: 14.4.9.2   Page: 365   Line: 24 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

Incorrect reference to 9.3.3.3

Change to 9.3.3.1.2 and make the link live

-

#15   Type: E   TF: TF4   Clause: 14.4.9.2   Page: 366   Line: 4 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

"IEEE Std 802.3, 64.3.5.1 and 77.3.5.1" is 1G/10G-EPON reference

Change to "IEEE Std 802.3, 144.3.8.1", also change "gate_timeout" to "GATE_TIMEOUT", since that is how it is specified in 802.3ca

-

#19   Type: TR   TF: TF4   Clause: 4A.2.15   Page: 432   Line: 10 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

U-MC2b is an ONU PICS, but the Value/Comment refers to OLT. Also, a reference is shown as TBD.

Replace "OLT forwards multicast traffic based on rules per TBD." with "ONU forwards multicast traffic based on rules per Table 7-2." Make link live.

-

#25   Type: T   TF: TF4   Clause: -   Page: 471   Line: - Commenter: Craig Pratt / CableLabs

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

Clause 11 can benefit from informational examples, in the form of an appendix

The addition of an appendix, which can be found in tf4_2406_pratt_onuauthexamples_1.pdf

-